

**THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH POLICY AND MANAGEMENT,  
in collaboration with the  
COLUMBIA ALLIANCE FOR HEALTHCARE MANAGEMENT<sup>1</sup>**

**PRESENTS:**

**THE 2007-2008 HEALTHCARE DELIVERY AND MANAGEMENT  
CASE COMPETITION**

*Overview*

Sponsored by: CIGNA and The Hay Group

Hosted by:  
Mailman School of Public Health  
Department of Health Policy and Management  
600 West 168<sup>th</sup> Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10032

***FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 2, 2007***

The Mailman School's Department of Health Policy and Management invites all MPH, EMPH, COTJ, MBA, EMBA, and MD (including dual-degree) graduate students to participate in the Inaugural Healthcare Delivery and Management Case Competition.

The competition will award certificates and American Express Gift Cards for the following honors:

- First Place (Team): \$100 Gift Card per team member
- Second Place (Team): \$50 Gift Card per team member
- Third Place (Team): \$25 Gift Card per team member
- Best Individual Presenter: \$100 Gift Card
- Best Individual Q & A: \$100 Gift Card
- Most Innovative Solution (Team): \$50 Gift Card per team member

---

<sup>1</sup> The Alliance coordinates faculty, student, and alumni interests across the Graduate Schools of Public Health, Business, and the College of Physicians and Surgeons. More information about the Alliance can be found at <http://www.cahm.columbia.edu> or contact the Executive Director, Professor Paul W. Thurman, at [Paul.Thurman@Columbia.edu](mailto:Paul.Thurman@Columbia.edu).

## ***Goals***

The case competition has several goals:

- Create opportunities for students to apply classroom learnings to a real-world healthcare case and executive management presentation environment
- Allow students from the three Alliance schools—Business, Medicine, and Public Health—to collaborate, to work, and to learn together in a cross-functional way
- Create a spirit of healthy competition and learning in order to reward achievement in clinical and health policy problem-solving and management analysis at both the team and individual levels
- Utilize faculty from the three Alliance Schools to advise teams—when appropriate—with respect to their analyses, toolkits, presentation skills, and question-and-answer abilities
- Foster creativity and practicality in terms of both qualitative and quantitative analysis as well as solution alternatives, pros and cons, and practical, executable solutions for a real client

While teams can comprise members of just one school, we encourage teams to draw on members and resources from other schools as the case will require management, policy, and clinical/outcomes analyses. Further, the case analysis should not be constrained by the information/scope articulated by the case. We fully expect teams to “think outside the box” in terms of related/dependent issues and challenges, and impacts of case solutions on the client organization outside the confines of the case.

## ***Competition Rules***

**Contacts:** Professor Paul W. Thurman, [Paul.Thurman@Columbia.edu](mailto:Paul.Thurman@Columbia.edu)

### **A. General Information to the Participants**

1. Teams will consist of 3 to 5 MPH, EMPH, COTJ, MBA, EMBA, and/or MD (including dual degree) students. **Dual-degree students are especially encouraged to participate!**
2. The teams may utilize a single faculty or academic advisor from any of the three Alliance schools
  - Advisors must be full-time or current-semester adjunct faculty
  - Advisors can only help with team work planning; advisors *may not* assist with case analyses (qualitative and quantitative), graphics, write-ups, or written presentations
  - Advisors cannot be affiliated with the firm(s) mentioned in the case, and advisors cannot contact the firm on behalf of the team
  - Advisors may, however, coach teams on their oral presentations

3. Travel costs to and from the competition will be borne by the teams. Meals and refreshments for all judges, sponsors, and teams will be provided on the day of the competition

**B. Competition Rules and Logistics**

1. The deadline for team signups is **Friday, October 12, 2007**
2. The assigned case and all materials, which will comprise a case study and analysis in a healthcare delivery and/or management context, will be sent out/posted on or about **Friday, October 5, 2007**
3. Teams may not solicit or receive help from anyone not on the team. Once the case is distributed, the faculty/staff advisor should *briefly* discuss the case with team members and help to develop a work plan for completing its preliminary presentation. However, the advisor may *not* assist or direct any analyses, presentation slides, or any other work directly related to answering case questions. The use of the Internet as well as textbooks is allowed, although directly contacting the company will not be permitted. Violation of this rule will result in disqualification
4. All presentations must be created in Microsoft PowerPoint, and every team is required to submit its presentation electronically no later than **Wednesday, October 31, 2007, at 5pm**, to [Paul.Thurman@Columbia.edu](mailto:Paul.Thurman@Columbia.edu) . Teams are encouraged to retain backups of their presentations. The first slide of the presentation should state the team name, school title(s) and list the presenters in the order in which they will present. All files will be loaded to the presentation machine with appropriate icons on the desktop for easy access
5. Teams are personally responsible for any hard copies to be given out during the presentation, including executive summaries and supporting documents
6. All presentations will be made electronically using the equipment provided
7. A random drawing will take place at 7:30 AM on Friday, November 2, 2007, to determine presentation orders and locations; the first presenter will begin at 8:00 AM
8. In the first round, there will be several rooms with two judges each—a faculty member (academic judge) and an outside healthcare executive (industry judge). One winner will be selected per room, and the winning teams will proceed to the final round of presentations/competition. In the final round, all preliminary round judges (to the fullest extent possible) will adjudicate finalist presentations
9. Judges will act as the Board of Directors and other members of the company as described in the case introduction. Teams are considered consultants that have been hired to solve the issues as identified by the company. The case introduction will direct attention to some of these issues. Participants are encouraged to respond to these issues, but presentations are not limited to the issues articulated by the company. All judges are familiar with the problems of the company being analyzed; thus, teams need not repeat the facts of the case. Teams should define and analyze the problem, and present and justify a plan of action
10. All members of the team will present a portion of the case, although each team member will not be required to speak for the same amount of time. Team

- presentations should not exceed 20 minutes. Each team will be given a total of 30 minutes to include the presentation, questions, and answers. Similar to a typical presentation with executives, students should anticipate interruptions from the judges during their presentations. A timekeeper will warn teams about the elapsed time and cut the discussion when its time is up
11. Questions from the judges may be directed towards an individual or to the team as a whole
  12. The first round of presentations will take place simultaneously in multiple rooms. Winners will be announced from each room and a final round will be held in the afternoon. Following the announcement of the winning teams from the first round, a random drawing will be held to determine final presentation order.
  13. Team members may not attend other first round presentations even if their presentation is done. Prior to their own presentations, team members may not talk with any attendees of the other presentations. Advisors and other spectators are welcome to attend all presentations as long as they do not talk with their own teams prior to their team's presentation. All audience members must leave the presentation room after each presentation to allow judges to discuss the previous presentation in privacy. Failure to comply with these rules will result in immediate disqualification. Teams that do not make it to the final round are encouraged to sit in during the final round of presentations.
  14. Once the preliminary round has been completed, teams may make adjustments/improvements to their presentations based on judges' feedback. Advisors may help, too, but advisors may not share any information obtained from others teams' presentations
  15. All teams and advisors are invited and encouraged to attend the final reception on November, 2, 2007, where the winners will be announced. The final ranking of the top three teams will be announced, and awards will be given for the Best Individual Presenter, the Best Individual Q & A, and the Most Innovative Solution (Team).
  16. For all competition events—including meals—business attire is required.

**Judging Criteria**

TEAM EVALUATION FOR: \_\_\_\_\_

Category	Weighted Score
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Presentation Style &amp; Clarity</b> - <i>How well did the team convey the main ideas? How professional were the documents and presentation? Did the presentation flow clearly? Did the executive summary and supporting documents support the presentation? Would you feel proud to have this team present to your managers/clients?</i></li> </ul> <p><u>Comments/Questions:</u></p>	Score from 1 to 10 _____
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Alternatives considered</b> - <i>Is it clear that the group considered more than one possible course of action, and has sound reasons why alternatives were rejected? Was the financial analysis appropriate? Did the team miss important and obvious alternatives? If information was unavailable or unknown to the team, did the team respond with a solution that was appropriate?</i></li> </ul> <p><u>Comments/Questions:</u></p>	Score from 1 to 15 _____
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Quality of analysis &amp; relevant supporting arguments</b> - <i>Use of appropriate, leading edge qualitative and quantitative analytical techniques to assess the current situation. Are the major issues articulated well? Would the arguments convince your manager/clients? Evaluate here the quality of any outside research.</i></li> </ul> <p><u>Comments/Questions:</u></p>	Score from 1 to 25 _____
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Quality of recommended actions</b> - <i>Is the recommended course of action feasible? Does it address the issues? Did the group consider the competitive marketplace reaction to their course of action?</i></li> </ul> <p><u>Comments/Questions:</u></p>	Score from 1 to 25 _____
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Responsiveness to Questions</b> - <i>Do the answers reflect an understanding of the issues? How clear are the supporting arguments? Do the answers reflect an understanding of the available information about the case?</i></li> </ul> <p><u>Comments/Questions:</u></p>	Score from 1 to 25 _____
<b>TOTAL SCORE</b> (out of 100 possible points)	_____

***Schedule***

***Wednesday, October 31, 2007***

By 5:00 PM Final presentations due to Paul Thurman via email

***Friday, November 2, 2007***

7:15 – 7:45 AM Arrive at the Mailman School of Public Health (specific address/location will be announced in mid-October)

7:15 AM Judges' breakfast and briefing (location TBD)

7:30 - Continental breakfast available for teams.  
Teams draw for room and presentation order. (Three teams will start—one in each judging room—promptly at 8am)

8:00 – 11:30 AM Preliminary round presentations

11:45 AM Group picture to be taken (will be arranged by team leaders)

NOON – 1:00 PM Lunch provided

12:45 – 1:00 PM Introduction of the first round judges, announcement of finalists, and judges provide feedback on the first round of presentations

1:00 – 1:30 PM Finalist teams make final edits to case presentations and resubmit (on USB key) to Paul Thurman

1:30 – 4:00 PM Final rounds

4:00-6:00 PM Keynote speaker, reception and announcement of winners (First, Second and Third place teams), Best Individual Presenter(s), Best Individual Q&A, Most Innovative Solution (Team)

6:00 PM Departure on your own schedule

**Registration**

*Please answer all items*

**School Name(s):**

**Team Name:**

**Number of Team Members (3-5 Required):**

First Name	Last Name	Degree/School	Graduation Date	Email
<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>

**Team Captain:**    
First Name Last Name

**Team Captain's Phone Number:**

**Team Captain's Address:**

**Advisor:**    
First Name Last Name

**Advisor Contact Information (Including School Affiliation(s)):**